

## STATE OF NEVADA

## OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL

100 North Carson Street Carson City, Nevada 89701-4717

CATHERINE CORTEZ MASTO Attorney General KEITH G. MUNRO Assistant Attorney General

> JIM SPENCER Chief of Staff

July 2, 2010

Mr. Robert P. Ellis The Robert P. Ellis and Sandra D. Ellis Living Trust 979 Camelia Drive Henderson, Nevada 89011 Matt Paque, Esq. Tronox LLC Post Office Box 268859 Oklahoma City, Oklahoma 73134

Re: 250 W. Warm Springs Road, Henderson, Nevada APN 178-12-610-001 Tronox LLC (TRX) NDEP Facility ID #H-000539 Nevada Division of Environmental Protection (NDEP) Response to: TRX E-mail: RE: NDEP "Parcel J" Letter Dated: April 16, 2010

Dear Messrs. Paque and Ellis:

I have reviewed the above-referenced e-mail from Mr. Paque, including the redacted sales agreement between TRX and the Robert P. Ellis and Sandra D. Ellis Living Trust Ellis Trust ("the Ellis Trust") attached, in addition to other relevant documentation including the January 31, 2008 Grant, Bargain, and Sale Deed. I understand that TRX sent this e-mail in response to an April 9, 2010 letter from the NDEP requesting a Sampling and Analysis Plan ("SAP") to assess the nature and extent of hazardous substance contamination on "Parcel J" by April 26, 2010.

Pursuant to Finding of Alleged Violations (FOAV) and Order issued by NDEP to TRX on December 14, 2010, TRX is responsible for continued remediation on Parcel J. Although the redacted portions of the purchase agreement appear to indicate an agreement between TRX and the Ellis Trust to cut off TRX's continued liability, the NDEP is not a party to this agreement. Moreover, this clause is contradicted by the language of the Grant, Bargain, and Sale Deed. I can find no applicable Nevada statutes that would relieve a responsible party of liability by a mere transfer of the property, without any corresponding agreement from the regulatory authority. Finally, unless the Ellis Trust qualifies for a defense as a bona fide prospective purchaser, it too is a responsible party. July 2, 2010 Page 2

Thus, it appears that both TRX and the Ellis Trust are responsible for the submittal of this document and any subsequent characterization and remediation. The NDEP is not obligated to pick and choose among responsible parties and delineate their respective liabilities. The NDEP leaves it in your capable hands to determine which party can most effectively meet the remediation obligations on Parcel J and to iron out any indemnification remedies you might have. Therefore, TRX and the Ellis Trust are required to submit the requested SAP by July 19, 2010.

Sincerely,

CATHERINE CORTEZ MASTO Attorney General By:

CAROLYN É. TANNER Deputy Attorney General (775) 684-1270

CET/lsd

EC: Jim Najima, Bureau of Corrective Actions, NDEP Greg Lovato, Bureau of Corrective Actions, NDEP Shannon Harbour, Bureau of Corrective Actions, NDEP Christa Smaling, BMI Coordinator, NDEP Mike Skromyda, Tronox LLC Michael J. Foster, Tronox LLC Keith Bailey, Environmental Answers LLC Deni Chambers, Northgate Environmental Brian Rakvica, McGinley and Associates Barry Conaty, Holland & Hart LLP Brenda Pohlmann, City of Henderson Mitch Kaplan, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region 9 Ebrahim Juma, Planning Manager, Air Quality and Environmental Management Joe McGinley, McGinley & Associates Ranajit Sahu, BRC Rick Kellogg, BRC Mark Paris, Landwell Craig Wilkinson, TIMET Kirk Stowers, Broadbent & Associates Victoria Tyson, Tyson Contracting George Crouse, Syngenta Crop Protection, Inc. Nick Pogoncheff, PES Environmental Lee Erickson, Stauffer Management Company Michael Bellotti, Olin Corporation Curt Richards, Olin Corporation

July 2, 2010 Page 3

> Paul Sundberg, Montrose Chemical Corporation Joe Kelly, Montrose Chemical Corporation of CA Jeff Gibson, AMPAC Larry Cummings, AMPAC

cc: Susan Crowley, C/O Tronox LLC, PO Box 55, Henderson, Nevada 89009 Robert P. Ellis and Sandra D. Ellis Living Trust, Attn: Robert P. Ellis, 979 Camelia, Henderson, Nevada, 89011